Acupuncture treatment for chronic knee pain: study by Hinman et al underestimates acupuncture efficacy

Hinman et al\(^1\) completed a Zelen design clinical trial for acupuncture in patients with chronic knee pain and concluded that neither laser nor needle acupuncture conferred benefit over sham for pain or function in patients older than 50 years with moderate or severe chronic knee pain. We disagree with the authors’ conclusion because they failed to use the most effective treatment regimen in their trial.

We consider that their treatment regimen is suboptimal for the following reasons.

First, the dosage of acupuncture is far from adequate. The protocol specified the acupuncture intervention as a 20 min treatment once or twice weekly for 12 weeks, with 8–12 sessions in total permitted.\(^1\) Treatment compliance was not reported. Even assuming full compliance, the study participants received only 0.67–1.0 session weekly, to a total of 160–240 min in 12 weeks. This was a smaller dose than was given in the treatment regimen in the trial by Witt et al\(^2\), in which participants received 12 sessions of 30 min duration administered over 8 weeks—that is, an average 1.5 sessions weekly and 360 min in total for only 8 weeks. It is worth pointing out that Witt et al reached a positive conclusion, the opposite to Hinman et al.

Second, the study protocol did not require de qi (a well-recognised acupuncture sensation), which is widely regarded as a prerequisite for acupuncture treatment efficacy.\(^3\)

Third, the paper did not follow the CONSORT statement of acupuncture\(^4\) which requires details of needling such as needle manipulation, depth of needle insertion and points selected (unilateral, bilateral or both).

Fourth, the dose of laser acupuncture was only 0.2 J per acupuncture point, which is considered too low to achieve a clinical effect.\(^5\) Evidence already existed in 2009 which suggested that the minimum dose should probably be 0.5 J per point.\(^5\)

Thus it is difficult to evaluate whether an effective treatment regimen was compared against the sham. Since the efficacies of acupuncture and laser acupuncture therapy depend on the dose of the intervention, it seems premature to reach the conclusion that acupuncture is not effective in the treatment of osteoarthritis pain of the knee.

Qinhong Zhang,\(^1\)\(^2\) Jinhuang Yue,\(^1\) Ying Lu\(^2\)

\(^1\)Department of Acupuncture and Moxibustion, Second Hospital of Heilongjiang University of Chinese Medicine, Harbin, China
\(^2\)Department of Health Research and Policy, Stanford University, Stanford, California, USA

Correspondence to Professor Ying Lu,

Department of Health Research and Policy, Stanford University, Stanford, CA 94305, USA; ylu1@stanford.edu

Contributors All the authors conceived the study, drafted the manuscript, contributed to the further writing of the manuscript and read and approved the final manuscript.

Funding This work was supported in part by the Outstanding Innovative Talents Supporting Project of Heilongjiang University of Chinese Medicine (grant number 2012RCQ64).

Competing interests None.

Provenance and peer review Not commissioned; internally peer reviewed.

To cite Zhang Q, Yue J, Lu Y. Acupunct Med Published Online First: [please include Day Month Year] doi:10.1136/acupmed-2015-010776

Received 22 January 2015
Accepted 12 February 2015

REFERENCES

Acupuncture treatment for chronic knee pain: study by Hinman et al underestimates acupuncture efficacy
Qinhong Zhang, Jinhuan Yue and Ying Lu

Acupunct Med published online March 5, 2015

Updated information and services can be found at:
http://aim.bmj.com/content/early/2015/03/05/acupmed-2015-010776

These include:

References
This article cites 4 articles, 1 of which you can access for free at:
http://aim.bmj.com/content/early/2015/03/05/acupmed-2015-010776#BIBL

Email alerting service
Receive free email alerts when new articles cite this article. Sign up in the box at the top right corner of the online article.

Notes

To request permissions go to:
http://group.bmj.com/group/rights-licensing/permissions

To order reprints go to:
http://journals.bmj.com/cgi/reprintform

To subscribe to BMJ go to:
http://group.bmj.com/subscribe/